

Contents

TABLE OF SELECTED AUTHORITIES	xxi
<i>Selected International Instrument Citations</i>	xxi
<i>Selected Cases, General Comments, & Advisory Opinions</i>	xxiii
PREFACE	xxix
<i>Researching International Human Rights Law</i>	xxx
<i>Note Regarding Editing</i>	xxxi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxxi
1. AN OVERVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS AND HUMANITARIAN LAW DEVELOPMENT AND THEIR PROTECTION MECHANISMS	1
1.1. The Historical and Conceptual Development of International Human Rights and Humanitarian Law	1
1.2. Overview of International Protection Mechanisms: History, Organization, and Operations	6
1.2.1. United Nations Mechanisms	6
1.2.1.1. UN Treaty-Based Tribunals	7
International Criminal Court	8
Human Rights Committee	8
Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination	10
Committee Against Torture	10
Committee to Eliminate Discrimination Against Women	11
Committee on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights	11
1.2.1.2. UN Charter-Based Tribunals and Other Mechanisms	11
International Court of Justice	11
International Criminal Tribunals for the Former Yugoslavia and Rwanda	11
UN High Commissioner for Human Rights	12
Procedure under ECOSOC Resolution No. 1503	12
Philip Alston, <i>The Commission on Human Rights</i> in Alston (ed.) <i>THE UNITED NATIONS AND HUMAN RIGHTS: A CRITICAL APPRAISAL</i> 126 (1992)	13
Procedure under ECOSOC Resolution No. 1235	14
Thematic and Country Mechanisms	15
International Labour Organisation	15
UN High Commissioner for Refugees	16

1.2.2. Regional Tribunals	16
European Court of Human Rights	16
Inter-American Commission and Court of Human Rights	17
African Commission and Court of Human and Peoples' Rights	19
Caribbean Court of Justice	19
1.2.3. Other Tribunals	20
Human Rights Commission for Bosnia and Herzegovina	20
Hybrid National-International, Criminal Tribunals	20
2. FORMAL SOURCES AND PRINCIPLES OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS AND HUMANITARIAN LAW	22
2.1. Formal Sources	22
ICJ Statute, art. 38	22
IAN BROWNLIE, PRINCIPLES OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW 3, 4 (4th ed. 1990)	23
2.1.1. Treaties	23
Reservations	25
U.S. Reservations, Declarations, and Understandings to the ICCPR (1992)	26
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	28
2.1.2. Customary International Law	28
IAN BROWNLIE, PRINCIPLES OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW 5–7, 10 (4th ed. 1990)	29
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	30
2.1.3. <i>Jus Cogens</i>	31
Francisco Forrest Martin, <i>Delineating a Hierarchical Outline of International Law Sources and Norms</i> , 65 SASK. L. REV. 333 (2002)	31
<i>Aloeboetoe et al. v. Suriname</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1993)	39
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	40
Advisory Opinion, <i>Judicial Guarantees in States of Emergency</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1987)	40
2.2. Principles of Interpretation	46
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, arts. 31 and 32	46
Hague Convention (IV) Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land, Martens Clause	47
ICC Statute, art. 21	47
Advisory Opinion, "Other Treaties" Subject to the Consultative Jurisdiction of the Court (Art. 64 of the American Convention on Human Rights), Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1982)	48
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	54
Paul Mahoney, <i>Judicial Activism and Judicial Self-Restraint in the European Court of Human Rights</i> , 11 HUM. RTS. L.J. 57 (1990)	54
Laurence R. Helfer, <i>Consensus, Coherence and the European Convention on Human Rights</i> , 26 CORNELL INT'L L.J. 133 (1993)	56
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	68

2.3. Principles of Liability	71
Dinah L. Shelton, <i>Private Violence, Public Wrongs, and the Responsibility of States</i> , 13 FORDHAM INT'L L.J. 1 (1990)	71
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	74
2.3.1. State Liability	75
Instruments	
<i>Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1988)	81
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	86
Francisco Forrest Martin, "U.S. Opposition to the International Criminal Court: What Now?" 1 <i>Accountability</i> 2-8 (2002)	90
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	96
<i>X. and Y. v. The Netherlands</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1985)	96
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	99
ANDREW CLAPHAM, HUMAN RIGHTS IN THE PRIVATE SPHERE 93-104 (1993)	100
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	102
2.3.2. Individual Liability: State and Non-State Actors	103
Instruments	
Superior Responsibility	110
Memorial <i>Amicus Curiae</i> submitted by Rights International, <i>Benavides Cevallos v. Ecuador</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1998)	110
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	114
<i>Prosecutor v. Kayishema & Ruzindana</i> , ICTR (2001)	115
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	121
2.3.3. Conspiracy and Corporate Responsibility	122
<i>Judgment for the Trial of German Major War Criminals</i> , International Military Tribunal (1946)	122
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	131
Steven R. Ratner, <i>Corporations and Human Rights: A Theory of Legal Responsibility</i> , 111 YALE L. J. 443 (2001)	132
2.3.4. Defenses	147
Statute of the International Criminal Court, Articles 31 and 33	147
State and Official Immunity	148
<i>Al-Adsani v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (2001)	148
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	159
<i>Democratic Republic of Congo v. Belgium</i> , ICJ (2002)	159
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	163
Combat Immunity	164
Geneva Convention (III) Relative to the Protection of Prisoners of War	164
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and Relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I)	165
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	168

Superior Orders, Coercion, and Duress	168
<i>In re Ohlendorf and Others (Einsatzgruppen Trial)</i> , IMT (1948)	168
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	171
Other Viable and Non-Viable Defenses	171
3. INCORPORATION OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS AND HUMANITARIAN LAW IN U.S. LAW	175
U.S. Constitution	175
3.1. Construction Rules	175
3.1.1. Constitutional Construction	175
3.1.1.1. Mandatory International Legal Construction Rule	176
Francisco Forrest Martin, <i>Our Constitution as Federal Treaty: A New Theory of United States Constitutional Construction Based on an Originalist Understanding for Addressing a New World</i> , 31 HASTINGS CONST. L. QUART. 258 (2004)	176
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	189
3.1.1.2. Persuasive Authority Rule	189
<i>Lawrence v. Texas</i> , 539 U.S. 558 (2003)	189
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	191
3.1.2. Federal and State Statutory Construction	191
3.1.2.1. Federal Mandatory Rule: The <i>Charming Betsy</i> and <i>Rossi</i> Rules	191
<i>Weinberger v. Rossi</i> , 456 U.S. 25 (1982)	191
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	192
Curtis A. Bradley, <i>The Charming Betsy Canon and Separation of Powers: Rethinking the Interpretive Role of International Law</i> , 86 GEO. L.J. 479, 495–533 (1998)	192
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	203
3.1.2.2. Persuasive Authority Rule	203
Laurence R. Helfer and Alice M. Miller, <i>Sexual Orientation and Human Rights: Toward a United States and Transnational Jurisprudence</i> , 9 HARV. HUM. RTS. J. 61 (1996)	203
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	205
3.2. Conflict Rules	205
3.2.1. Treaties and Federal Statutes: The Last-in-Time Rule	205
<i>Chae Chan Ping v. United States (The Chinese Exclusion Case)</i> , 130 U.S. 581 (1889)	205
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	212
Francisco Forrest Martin, <i>Our Constitution as Federal Treaty: A New Theory of United States Constitutional Construction Based on an Originalist Understanding for Addressing a New World</i> , 31 HASTINGS CONST. L. QUART. 258 (2004)	212
3.2.2. Customary International Law and Other Federal Law: The <i>García-Mir</i> Rule	216
<i>García-Mir v. Meese</i> , 788 F.2d 1446 (11th Cir. 1986)	217
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	219

Francisco Forrest Martin, <i>Our Constitution as Federal Treaty: A New Theory of United States Constitutional Construction Based on an Originalist Understanding for Addressing a New World</i> , 31 HASTINGS CONST. L. QUART. 258 (2004)	219
3.3. Self-Execution Doctrine	220
3.3.1. Treaties	220
FRANCISCO FORREST MARTIN, CHALLENGING HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS: USING INTERNATIONAL LAW IN U.S. COURTS (2001)	221
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	235
John C. Yoo, <i>Globalism and the Constitution: Treaties, Non-Self-Execution, and the Original Understanding</i> , 99 COLUM. L. REV. 1955 (1999)	236
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	239
John C. Yoo, <i>Rejoinder, Treaties and Public Lawmaking: A Textual and Structural Defense of Non-Self-Execution</i> , 99 COLUM. L. REV. 2218, 2233 <i>et passim</i> (1999)	240
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	244
Francisco Forrest Martin, <i>Our Constitution as Federal Treaty: A New Theory of United States Constitutional Construction Based on an Originalist Understanding for Addressing a New World</i> , 31 HASTINGS CONST. L. QUART. 258 (2004)	246
3.3.2. Customary International Law	254
<i>Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain</i> , 124 S. Ct. 2739 (2004)	254
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	267
4. INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS TRIBUNAL PROCEDURE AND REMEDIES	270
4.1. Jurisdiction	270
Advisory Opinion, <i>Interpretation of the American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man within the Framework of Article 64 of the American Convention on Human Rights</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1989)	271
<i>Banković and Others v. Belgium and Others</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (2001)	276
Francisco Forrest Martin, <i>The International Human Rights Aspects of the Forum Non Conveniens Doctrine</i> , 35 U. MIAMI INTER-AM. L. REV. 101, 106–109 (2003)	284
4.2. Standing	286
<i>A group of associations . . . v. Italy</i> , UNHRC (1990)	287
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	288
4.3. Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies	289
<i>Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras</i> , Preliminary Objections, Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1989)	291
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	294
Advisory Opinion, <i>Exceptions to the Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies in Cases of Indigency or Inability to Obtain Legal Representation Because of a Generalized Fear Within the Legal Community</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1990)	295
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	301

4.4. Remedies and State Compliance	301
Restitution	302
Satisfaction	304
Indemnity	305
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	305
5. SUBSTANTIVE INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS AND HUMANITARIAN LAW PROTECTIONS	307
5.1. Fundamental International Human Rights Protections	307
5.1.1. Rights to Life and Humane Treatment	307
Instruments	
Torture; Cruel, Inhuman, Degrading Treatment or Punishment; and Sexual Violence	315
<i>Ireland v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1978)	315
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	320
<i>Hernández Rivas v. El Salvador</i> , Inter-Am. Cm. H.R. (1994)	322
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	326
UNHRC General Comment 20 (Article 7)	326
Abortion	329
“ <i>The Baby Boy</i> ” Case, Inter-Am. Cm. H.R. (1981)	330
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	332
<i>Vo v. France</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (2004)	333
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	338
Death Penalty	339
Instruments	
<i>Domingues v. United States</i> , Inter-Am. Cm. H.R. (2002)	339
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	351
<i>Soering v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1989)	351
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	357
<i>Judge v. Canada</i> , UNHRC (2003)	361
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	364
Abductions, Disappearances, and Summary Executions	364
<i>Saldías de López v. Uruguay</i> , UNHRC (1981)	365
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	369
<i>Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1988)	370
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	370
5.1.2. Rights to Personal Security and Liberty	371
Instruments	
<i>Murray v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1994)	374
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	389
<i>Suárez Rosero v. Ecuador</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1997)	391
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	398

Advisory Opinion, <i>Judicial Guarantees in States of Emergency</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1987)	399
Questions & Comments	399
5.1.3. Right to Freedom from Discrimination	404
Instruments	
Intentional Discrimination	407
Advisory Opinion, <i>Proposed Amendments to the Naturalization Provisions of the Constitution of Costa Rica</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1984)	407
Questions & Comments	414
<i>Salgueiro da Silva Mouta v. Portugal</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1999)	416
Questions & Comments	420
Unintentional and Disparate Impact Discrimination	421
<i>Simunek, Hastings, Tuzilova and Prochazka v. The Czech Republic</i> , UNHRC (1995)	421
Questions & Comments	425
<i>Abdulaziz, Cabales and Balkandali v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1985)	425
Questions & Comments	444
Affirmative Action	447
<i>Marschall v. Land Nordrhein-Westfalen</i> , Eur. Ct. J. (1997)	447
Questions & Comments	452
5.2. International Humanitarian Law Protections and Human Rights-Related International Crimes	453
5.2.1. Genocide	453
Instruments	
<i>Prosecutor v. Akayesu</i> , ICTR (1998)	454
Questions & Comments	473
5.2.2. Crimes Against Humanity	475
Instruments	
<i>Prosecutor v. Tadić</i> (Final Judgment), ICTY (1997)	477
Questions & Comments	490
<i>Prosecutor v. Akayesu</i> , ICTR (1998)	492
Questions & Comments	502
5.2.3. War Crimes	503
Instruments	
International and Noninternational Conflicts	522
<i>Prosecutor v. Tadić</i> (Final Judgment), ICTY (1997).	522
Questions & Comments	527
The Proportionality Rule and Superfluous Injury and Unnecessary Suffering (SIrUS) Rule	529
Francisco Forrest Martin, <i>Using International Human Rights Law for Establishing a Unified Use of Force Rule in the Law of Armed Conflict</i> , 64(2) SASK. L. REV. 347 (2002)	529
Questions & Comments	533

Rights International Memorial <i>Amicus Curiae</i> in <i>Prosecutor v. Galić</i> , ICTY (2003)	534
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	542
FRANCISCO FORREST MARTIN, CHALLENGING HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS: USING INTERNATIONAL LAW IN U.S. COURTS 130–41 (2001)	543
5.3. Criminal and Civil Procedural Rights	552
Instruments	
Presumption of Innocence	563
<i>Allenet de Ribemont v. France</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1995)	563
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	567
Assistance of Legal Counsel	568
<i>Grant v. Jamaica</i> , UNHRC (1994)	568
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	573
Advisory Opinion, <i>The Right to Information on Consular Assistance in the Framework of the Guarantees of the Due Process of Law</i> <i>Inter-American Court of Human Rights</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (1999)	577
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	589
Judicial and Jury Impartiality	590
<i>Andrews v. United States</i> , Inter-Am. Cm. H.R. (1997)	590
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	604
Equality of Arms: Examination of Witnesses and Documents	604
<i>Harward v. Norway</i> , UNHRC (1994)	604
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	606
<i>Edwards v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1992)	609
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	619
<i>Kostovski v. The Netherlands</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1989)	619
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	630
<i>Prosecutor v. Kayishema & Ruzindana</i> , ICTR (2001)	632
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	634
Self-Incrimination	634
<i>Funke v. France</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1993)	634
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	639
Length of Proceedings	640
<i>Firmenich v. Argentina</i> , Inter-Am. Cm. H.R. (1989)	640
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	644
Retrospective Criminal Laws	646
<i>Welch v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1995)	646
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	652
Punishment	653

Instruments	
<i>Prosecutor v. Kambanda</i> , ICTR (2000)	655
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	657
5.4. Rights to Privacy and Respect for Family Life	659
Instruments	
Surveillance, Search and Seizure, and the Exclusionary Rule	662
<i>Peck v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (2003)	662
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	670
<i>Klass and Others v. Germany</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1978)	670
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	676
<i>García Pérez v. Peru</i> , Inter-Am. Cm. H.R. (1995)	678
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	680
<i>Crémieux v. France</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1993)	680
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	684
Sexual Orientation and Practice	685
<i>Toonen v. Australia</i> , UNHRC. (1994)	685
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	689
Transgendered Persons	692
<i>Goodwin v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (2002)	692
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	711
Parental Rights and the Right to Familial Integrity	711
<i>Fei v. Colombia</i> , UNHRC (1995)	711
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	719
Abortion	724
<i>Brüggenmann and Scheuten v. Federal Republic of Germany</i> , Eur. Cm. H.R. (1977)	724
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	727
<i>Paton v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Cm. H.R. (1980)	729
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	734
5.5. Freedom of Conscience	734
Instruments	
<i>Kokkinakis v. Greece</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1993)	736
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	747
5.6. Freedom of Expression	750
Instruments	
Defamation	753
<i>Lingens v. Austria</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1986)	753
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	762
Offensive Expression	768
<i>J.R.T. and the W.G. Party v. Canada</i> , UNHRC. (1983)	768
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	770

<i>Müller and Others v. Switzerland</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1988)	772
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	786
<i>Open Door Counselling and Dublin Well Woman v. Ireland</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1992)	790
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	800
National Security	803
<i>THE OBSERVER AND GUARDIAN v. United Kingdom</i> (“ <i>The Spycatcher Case</i> ”), Eur. Ct. H.R. (1991)	803
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	822
Media Access and Licensing, and Commercial Expression	825
<i>Barthold v. Federal Republic of Germany</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1985)	825
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	840
5.7. Freedom of Association and Assembly	844
Instruments	
<i>Plattform ‘Ärzte für das Leben’ v. Austria</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1988)	846
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	849
5.8. Right to Marriage	851
Instruments	
<i>Goodwin v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (2002)	852
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	854
<i>Johnston v. Ireland</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1986)	855
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	864
5.9. Right to Vote	866
Instruments	
<i>Statehood Solidarity Committee v. United States</i> , Inter-Am. Cm H.R. (2003)	869
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	880
5.10. Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights	881
Instruments	
<i>The Nature of States Parties Obligations</i> , ECOSOC Ctte. General Comment No. 3 (1990)	891
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	894
<i>Five Pensioners Case</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (2003)	895
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	899
5.10.1. Employment	900
<i>Advisory Opinion, Juridical Condition and Rights of the Undocumented Migrants</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (2003)	900
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	911
5.10.2. Property	911
Instruments	
<i>The Mayagna (Sumo) Awas Tingni Community v. Nicaragua</i> , Inter-Am. Ct. H.R. (2001)	913
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	915

<i>James v. United Kingdom</i> , Eur. Ct. H.R. (1986)	916
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	930
<i>Stran Greek Refineries and Stratis Andreadis v. Greece</i> (Merits), Eur. Ct. H.R. (1994)	931
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	936
6. THEORY AND CRITIQUE	938
RICHARD FALK, <i>THE END OF WORLD ORDER: ESSAYS ON NORMATIVE INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS</i> (1983)	938
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	940
LOUIS HENKIN, <i>THE AGE OF RIGHTS</i> (1990)	941
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	943
Yash Ghai, <i>Universalism and Relativism: Human Rights as a Framework for Negotiating Interethnic Claims</i> , 21 <i>CARDOZO L. REV.</i> 1095–1102 (2000)	944
Abdullah Ahmen An-Na'im, <i>Human Rights in the Muslim World: Socio-Political Conditions and Scriptural Imperatives</i> , 3 <i>HARV. HUM. RTS. J.</i> 13 (1990)	949
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	956
Hilary Charlesworth, Christine Chinkin & Shelley Wright, <i>Feminist Approaches to International Law</i> , 85 <i>AM. J. INT'L L.</i> 613 (1991)	956
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	958
Thomas M. Franck, <i>Legitimacy in the International System</i> , 82 <i>AM. J. INT'L L.</i> 705 (1988)	958
David Kennedy, <i>The International Human Rights Movement: Part of the Problem?</i> , 15 <i>HARV. HUM. RTS. J.</i> 101 (2002)	967
<i>Questions & Comments</i>	986
INDEX	987

For educational use and reference only